

**Summary Minutes of the
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)
Public Teleconference
November 28, 2011**

Date and Time: Monday, November 28, 2011, 10:00 AM – 12:00 PM ET

Location: Teleconference Only

Purpose: The purpose of the teleconference was to review a draft report entitled “CASAC Review of EPA’s Integrated Science Assessment for Lead (First External Review Draft – May 2011)”.

Participants: CASAC Members (for full roster, see Attachment A)

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet, Chair

Mr. George Allen

Dr. Ana Diez-Roux

Dr. H. Christopher Frey

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell

Dr. Helen Suh

Dr. Kathleen Weathers

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer (DFO)

Dr. John Vandenberg, EPA National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA)

Dr. Ellen Kirrane, EPA NCEA

Other Attendees (See Attachment B)

Opening Remarks

Mr. Aaron Yeow, the DFO, opened the meeting. He noted that as required under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), CASAC's deliberations are held in public with advanced notice given in the Federal Register¹, and the meeting minutes will be made publicly available after the meeting. He noted that CASAC did not receive any public comments and did not receive any requests for oral public statements. He also noted that the CASAC members are subject to compliance with federal ethics regulations and conflict-of-interest laws that pertain to them. He then turned the meeting over to Dr. Jonathan Samet, Chair of CASAC.

Dr. Samet welcomed everyone and indicated that the purpose of the meeting was to review the draft letter on EPA's ISA² and that the goal was to discuss any substantive issues the members had on the letter. He welcomed and introduced a new member to CASAC, Dr. Ana Diez-Roux. Dr. Diez-Roux stated that she was a professor of epidemiology at the University of Michigan and has expertise in air issues. There were not any public comments, so Dr. Samet turned the meeting over to Dr. Chris Frey, chair of the CASAC Lead Review Panel, to go over the letter. The meeting proceeded according to the agenda³.

Letter to the Administrator

Dr. Frey went through the letter, summarizing the Panel's comments and recommendations. One member had a comment about the Panel's recommendation on lines 19-21 on page 2 regarding the weight of evidence assessment of specific health endpoints vs. the broad assessment of impacts on whole organ systems. It was agreed that edits will be made to the text to clarify the Panel's recommendation.

There was discussion regarding the reiteration of CASAC's previous advice on developing a new sampler for lead and where things currently stood with EPA's development of a new sampler. It was not clear where things stood with EPA's development, and it was agreed that the ISA was probably not the right place to discuss it.

There was discussion regarding the Panel's comments and recommendations pertaining to susceptibility and vulnerability. There was agreement that the advice needs to be consistent with prior CASAC advice on susceptibility and vulnerability given during the review of the Ozone ISA. Dr. Samet and Dr. Frey agreed to work on language to make the advice in this letter consistent with prior CASAC advice.

Regarding ecological effects, one member mentioned that there needed to be a clear recommendation regarding the REACH data on page 5, line 9. It was agreed that language would be added to clarify the recommendation.

Consensus Response to Charge Questions

Dr. Frey went through the consensus responses to the charge questions. It was agreed that lines 28-31 on page A-3 would be deleted because it created confusion and did not add much value to the letter. One member suggested that lines 22-24 on page A-8 be deleted, but Dr. Frey stated

that it was a specific recommendation from the Panel, so it was agreed to keep the language. There was discussion regarding lines 6-7 on page A-18 and it was agreed to clarify the language to be less general and more specific.

Dr. Samet discussed next steps and action items. With the business concluded, the Designated Federal Officer adjourned the meeting at 11:30 AM ET.

Respectfully Submitted:

Certified as Accurate:

/Signed/

/Signed/

Mr. Aaron Yeow
Designated Federal Officer
EPA SAB Staff Office

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet
Chair
CASAC

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the CASAC website:
<http://www.epa.gov/casac>, at the [November 28, 2011 CASAC Meeting page](#):

¹ Federal Register Notice Announcing the Meeting

² 10-25-11 Draft CASAC Review of EPA's Integrated Science Assessment for Lead (First External Review Draft – May 2011)

³ Agenda for the November 28, 2011 Public Meeting

ATTACHMENT A - ROSTER

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee

CHAIR

Dr. Jonathan M. Samet, Professor and Flora L. Thornton Chair, Department of Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

MEMBERS

Mr. George A. Allen, Senior Scientist, Northeast States for Coordinated Air Use Management (NESCAUM), Boston, MA

Dr. Ana Diez-Roux, Professor of Epidemiology, School of Public Health, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, Professor, Department of Civil, Construction and Environmental Engineering, College of Engineering, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC

Dr. Armistead (Ted) Russell, Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA

Dr. Helen Suh, Program Area Director, Environmental Health, Public Health Division, National Opinion Research Corporation (NORC) at the University of Chicago, West Newton, MA

Dr. Kathleen Weathers, Senior Scientist, Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies, Millbrook, NY

SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF

Dr. Holly Stallworth, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Officer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC

**ATTACHMENT B – Other Attendees
CASAC Public Teleconference**

November 28, 2011

Name	Affiliation
Bower, Terri	Gradient
Brown, James	EPA
David, Anne	
Dzubow, Rebecca	EPA
Hines, Erin	EPA
Hoyer, Marion	EPA
Lassiter, Meredith	EPA
Maupin, Mary	Michigan Department of Environmental Quality
McDow, Stephen	EPA
Meacham, Connie	EPA
Orlin, David	EPA
Owens, Beth	EPA
Pedde, Meredith	EPA
Richmond-Bryant, Jennifer	EPA
Ross, Mary	EPA
Sun, Gulan	Texas Council of Environmental Quality (TCEQ)
Svendsgaard, David	EPA
Vinikoor-Imler, Lisa	EPA
Walsh, Debra	EPA
Wilson, Linda	New York State Attorney General's Office